

# Business Decisions and Ethical Dilemmas

## Summary

Ethical dilemmas are problems where two or more options can have strong support, such as outsourcing vs cutting salaries and keeping local workers. R.M. Kidder summarized an approach to sort the kinds of dilemmas we face and to resolve them using simple rules:

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Truth vs loyalty</b></li> <li>• <b>Individual vs community</b></li> <li>• <b>Short-term vs long-term</b></li> <li>• <b>Justice vs mercy</b></li> </ul>	<b>apply resolution rules</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Ends-based thinking</b> <i>utilitarianism</i></li> <li>• <b>Rule-based thinking</b> <i>categorical imperative</i></li> <li>• <b>Care-based thinking</b> <i>Golden Rule</i></li> </ul>
--	---------------------------------------	---

**Principles for allocation of scarce medical interventions** is a model for managing some dilemmas involving bioethics:

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. <b>treat people equally</b></li> <li>b. <b>favor the worst off</b></li> <li>c. <b>maximize total benefits</b></li> <li>d. <b>reward social usefulness</b></li> </ul>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>United Network for Organ Sharing points systems</b></li> <li>2. <b>quality-adjusted life-years</b></li> <li>3. <b>disability-adjusted life-years</b></li> <li>4. <b>complete lives system recommended:</b>  <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>prioritizes younger people</li> <li>incorporates prognosis</li> <li>save the most lives</li> <li>lottery</li> <li>instrumental value principles</li> </ul> </li> </ol>
--	--

In this presentation, a more general approach is described which may be of value in a wider range of areas. It is still a work in progress. It adds additional layers to the Kidder model, by including triage and scoring from Management of Technology and Time available, which affects the changing roles of Leadership and Management. Scoring is a combination of importance of elements and the views of judges. In figure skating, the skating association sets the percentage for elements while judges give values for how well each are presented. The elements of the bioethics model are shown to fit into the more general model. Examples are given for some business ethical dilemmas. The model does not create decisions, but shows where and to what extent individual philosophy and preferences are involved.

Decision Layers			Deciders: Tech, Social, Financial	Judges	Score
<b>A. Time</b>	short	long			
<b>B. Triage</b>	Usual	Inverse			
<b>C. Ethical</b>	dilemma	philosophy			
<b>D. Triage: T,S,F</b>	score		S+T+F=100%	1 - 10	$\Sigma (S,T,F) \times (1 - 10)$
<b>E. Social Value</b>			tie breaker	1 - 10	choice

Key words: allocation of scarce resources; bioethics; ethical dilemmas; figure of merit; leadership and management; Management of Technology; scoring methods; triage; United Network for Organ Sharing

# Business Decisions and Ethical Dilemmas

©Sidney Feinleib 2012

## Summary

Ethical dilemmas are problems where two or more options can have strong support, such as outsourcing and reducing staff versus cutting salaries and keeping local workers; or, if nurse could only save a few people during a tsunami, should it be those who can walk or the bedridden who cannot help themselves? R.M. Kidder summarized dilemmas as being of four kinds: He proposes three ways of thinking to resolve the dilemmas: **Principles for allocation of scarce medical interventions** is a model in bioethics which has some of the same principles with added points specific to medicine.

A more general approach is described here, which may be of value in a wide range of areas. It is still a work in progress. It adds additional layers to the Kidder Ethical model(C), by including (B)triage as used in emergency situations, (D)Scoring from Management of Technology, (A)Time, which affects the changing roles of Leadership and Management, and (E)Social Value as a last resort for a tie-breaker. Scoring combines the importance of elements and the views of judges. In technology assessment, very detailed mathematical analyses are used in setting priorities and evaluations, but human input is still required. In figure skating, the skating association sets the percentage for elements while judges give values for how well each are presented.

The elements of the bioethics model are shown to fit into the more general model. Examples are given for some business ethical dilemmas. The model does not create decisions, but shows where and to what extent individual philosophy and preferences are involved.

Decision Layers			Deciders: Tech, Social, Financial	Judges	Score
A. Time	long	short			
B. Triage	Usual	Inverse			
C. Ethical	dilemma	philosophy			
D. Triage: T,S,F	score		$S+T+F=100\%$	1 - 10	$\Sigma (S,T,F) \times (1 - 10)$
E. Social Value			tie breaker	1 - 10	choice

Key words: allocation of scarce resources; bioethics; ethical dilemmas; figure of merit; leadership and management; Management of Technology; scoring methods; triage; United Network for Organ Sharing

For homework study:

<http://wwwsoc.nii.ac.jp/bcs/images/gakkaishi1-03.pdf> **The Energetics of Business**

<http://www.globalethics.org/resources/Chapter-1-How-Good-People-Make-Tough-Choices-by-Rushworth-M-Kidder/28/> register and download online, or for a summary read:

[http://econopundit.com/ezekiel\\_emmauel.pdf](http://econopundit.com/ezekiel_emmauel.pdf) **Principles for allocation of scarce medical interventions**